

# Quantitative translations for viscosity approximation methods

Pedro Pinto  
(j.w.w. Ulrich Kohlenbach)

Technische Universität Darmstadt  
Department of Mathematics



Computability and Complexity in Analysis  
26 July, 2021

# Outline

- 1 Preliminaries
- 2 A theorem by Suzuki
- 3 Uniqueness and convergence

# Basic notions on mappings

Let  $X$  be a Banach space.

- A map  $\phi : X \rightarrow X$  is a **strict contraction** if

$$\exists r \in [0, 1) \forall x, y \in X (\|\phi(x) - \phi(y)\| \leq r\|x - y\|)$$

Theorem (Banach's fixed point theorem)

*Let  $X$  be a Banach space and  $\phi$  a strict contraction.*

*Then  $\phi$  has an unique fixed point  $z (= \lim \phi^n(z_0))$ , for any  $z_0 \in X$ .*

# Basic notions on mappings

Let  $X$  be a Banach space.

- A map  $\phi : X \rightarrow X$  is a **strict contraction** if

$$\exists r \in [0, 1) \forall x, y \in X (\|\phi(x) - \phi(y)\| \leq r\|x - y\|)$$

## Theorem (Banach's fixed point theorem)

*Let  $X$  be a Banach space and  $\phi$  a strict contraction.*

*Then  $\phi$  has an unique fixed point  $z (= \lim \phi^n(z_0))$ , for any  $z_0 \in X$ .*

- A map  $T : X \rightarrow X$  is **nonexpansive** if

$$\forall x, y \in X (\|T(x) - T(y)\| \leq \|x - y\|)$$

# Viscosity approximation method

For  $C$  closed and convex,  $u, x_0 \in C$ ,  $T : C \rightarrow C$  nonexpansive and  $(\alpha_n) \subset [0, 1]$ , consider the **Halpern iteration**

$$\text{H: } x_0 \in C \text{ and } x_{n+1} = \alpha_n u + (1 - \alpha_n)T(x_n), n \in \mathbb{N}.$$

# Viscosity approximation method

For  $C$  closed and convex,  $u, x_0 \in C$ ,  $T : C \rightarrow C$  nonexpansive and  $(\alpha_n) \subset [0, 1]$ , consider the **Halpern iteration**

$$\text{H: } x_0 \in C \text{ and } x_{n+1} = \alpha_n u + (1 - \alpha_n) T(x_n), n \in \mathbb{N}.$$

In connection with concrete problems in convex optimization, Yamada introduced in 2001 the *hybrid steepest descent method* (HSDM). Independently, Moudafi introduced the **viscosity method**

$$\text{vH: } x_0 \in C \text{ and } x_{n+1} = \alpha_n \phi(x_n) + (1 - \alpha_n) T(x_n), n \in \mathbb{N},$$

where  $\phi$  is a strict contraction, and has HSDM as a particular case.

The study of these iterations is highly relevant in many practical situations in optimization.

## Iterations with sequences of n.e. maps

Let  $\phi$  be a strict contraction,  $(\alpha_n) \subset [0, 1]$  a sequence of real numbers, and  $u$  an element of  $C$ .

For  $(S_n)$  a sequence of nonexpansive maps on  $C$ , we consider

- the  $(S_n)$ -Halpern iteration:

$(S_n)$ -H:  $w_0(u) = u$  and  $w_{n+1}(u) = \alpha_n u + (1 - \alpha_n)S_n(w_n(u))$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$

- the  $(S_n)$ -viscosity-Halpern iteration:

$(S_n)$ -vH:  $x_0 \in C$ , and  $x_{n+1} = \alpha_n \phi(x_n) + (1 - \alpha_n)S_n(x_n)$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$

# Suzuki's theorem

- $(X, C, (S_n), (\alpha_n))$  has the **Halpern's property** if:

For any  $u \in C$ , the  $(S_n)$ -H iteration  $(w_n(u))$  is strongly convergent.



# Suzuki's theorem

- $(X, C, (S_n), (\alpha_n))$  has the **Halpern's property** if:

For any  $u \in C$ , the  $(S_n)$ -H iteration  $(w_n(u))$  is strongly convergent.

E.g., if  $X$  is a Hilbert space,  $C$  is bounded, and  $(S_n)$  is constant, then  $(X, C, (S_n), (\frac{1}{n+1}))$  has the Halpern's property.

## Suzuki's theorem

- $(X, C, (S_n), (\alpha_n))$  has the **Halpern's property** if:

For any  $u \in C$ , the  $(S_n)$ -H iteration  $(w_n(u))$  is strongly convergent.

E.g., if  $X$  is a Hilbert space,  $C$  is bounded, and  $(S_n)$  is constant, then  $(X, C, (S_n), (\frac{1}{n+1}))$  has the Halpern's property.

## Theorem (Suzuki (2007))

*Let  $(X, C, (S_n), (\alpha_n))$  have Halpern's property. Let  $\phi$  be a strict contraction, and for each  $u \in C$ , define  $Pu := \lim_n w_n(u)$ . If  $\lim_n \alpha_n = 0$  and  $\sum \alpha_n = \infty$ , then the  $(S_n)$ -vH iteration strongly converges to the unique point  $z$  satisfying  $P\phi z = z$ .*

# Rates and metastability

- **Rate of convergence** (to  $x$ ) is a function  $\rho : (0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ :

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall n \geq \rho(\varepsilon) (\|x_n - x\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

- **Cauchy rate** is a function  $\rho : (0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ :

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall i, j \geq \rho(\varepsilon) (\|x_i - x_j\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

- **Rate of metastability** is a function  $\varphi : (0, \infty) \times \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ :

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall f \in \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} \exists n \leq \varphi(\varepsilon, f) \forall i, j \in [n, f(n)] (\|x_i - x_j\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

# Rates and metastability

- **Rate of convergence** (to  $x$ ) is a function  $\rho : (0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ :

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall n \geq \rho(\varepsilon) (\|x_n - x\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

- **Cauchy rate** is a function  $\rho : (0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ :

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall i, j \geq \rho(\varepsilon) (\|x_i - x_j\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

- **Rate of metastability** is a function  $\varphi : (0, \infty) \times \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$ :

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall f \in \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} \exists n \leq \varphi(\varepsilon, f) \forall i, j \in [n, f(n)] (\|x_i - x_j\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

- For any  $b \in \mathbb{N}^*$ ,  $\theta_b : (0, \infty) \times \mathbb{N}^{\mathbb{N}} \times \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{N}$  satisfies ( $H[S_n]$ ):

For any  $u \in C$  with  $\|u\| \leq b$ ,  
 $\theta_b$  is a rate of metastability (with lower bound) for  $(w_n(u))$ .

## Suzuki's proofs

(1) Consider  $z$  such that  $P\phi z = z$ .

(2) Then  $z = P\phi z = \lim_n w_n(\phi z)$ .

(3) Finally  $\lim_n x_n = z$ .

## Suzuki's proofs

(1) Consider  $z$  such that  $P\phi z = z$ .

(2) Then  $z = P\phi z = \lim_n w_n(\phi z)$ .

(3) Finally  $\lim_n x_n = z$ .

From a proof mining perspective, the difficulty in analysing Suzuki's proof is in step (1), the existence of the point  $z$ .

The proof-theoretic interpretation of  $\Pi_3^0 \rightarrow \Pi_3^0$ , as in “Cauchy $\rightarrow$ Cauchy”, translates classically (via a negative translation) into “Metastability rate $\rightarrow$ Metastability rate” and constructively into “Cauchy rate $\rightarrow$ Cauchy rate”.

Why  $z = P\phi z$  exists?

$P$  nonexpansive +  $\phi$  strict contraction  $\implies P\phi$  strict contraction  
 $\implies \exists! z \in C (z = P\phi(z))$

# Why $z = P\phi z$ exists?

$$\begin{aligned} P \text{ nonexpansive} + \phi \text{ strict contraction} &\implies P\phi \text{ strict contraction} \\ &\implies \exists! z \in C (z = P\phi(z)) \end{aligned}$$

Furthermore, the fixed point is the limit of the Picard iteration:

$$z = \lim(P\phi)^n(z_0), \text{ for any } z_0 \in C.$$



$$z_0 \in C \longrightarrow \phi z_0 \longrightarrow \lim w_n(\phi z_0) = P\phi z_0 = z_1$$

$$z_1 \longrightarrow \phi z_1 \longrightarrow \lim w_n(\phi z_1) = P\phi z_1 = (P\phi)^2 z_0 = z_2$$

$\vdots$

$$z = \lim z_n = \lim (P\phi)^n z_0$$

$$\begin{aligned}z_0 \in C &\longrightarrow \phi z_0 \longrightarrow \lim w_n(\phi z_0) = P\phi z_0 = z_1 \\z_1 &\longrightarrow \phi z_1 \longrightarrow \lim w_n(\phi z_1) = P\phi z_1 = (P\phi)^2 z_0 = z_2 \\&\vdots \\z &= \lim z_n = \lim (P\phi)^n z_0\end{aligned}$$

- Instead of using the limit point of  $w_n(\phi z_i)$ , we just take a 'good enough' Cauchy point.
- We make this construction long enough to ensure stability for some point  $z_M$ , i.e. such that  $\|z_{M+1} - z_M\| \leq \varepsilon$ .
- We then adapt the arguments to use such  $z_M$  instead of the fixed point  $z$

## Quantitative results

## Theorem

Let  $b \geq \text{diam}(C)$ ,  $\phi$  an  $r$ -contraction with  $\delta \in (0, 1]$  s.t.  $r \leq 1 - \delta$ ,  $\theta_b$  satisfy  $(H[S_n])$ , and  $A$  be a rate of divergence for  $(\sum \alpha_n)$ .  
Then  $(x_n)$  satisfying  $(S_n)$ -vH is a Cauchy sequence with metastability rate

$$\Psi(\varepsilon, f) = \Psi[b, \delta, A, \theta_b](\varepsilon, f) = \tilde{A} \left( \psi_{M+1} + \left\lceil \log \frac{6b}{\varepsilon} \right\rceil \right) + 1$$

where  $\Psi_0 = A(1) + 1$  and  $\Psi_{m+1} = \theta_b(\varepsilon_0, f_{M-m}, \Psi_m)$ , with

$$\tilde{A}(k) := A \left( \left\lceil \frac{k}{\delta} \right\rceil \right), \quad \varepsilon_0 = \frac{\varepsilon \delta^2}{30}, \quad M = \left\lceil \log_{1-\frac{\delta}{2}} \left( \frac{\varepsilon \delta}{15b} \right) \right\rceil \quad \text{and}$$

$$\text{for all } p \in \mathbb{N}, \quad \begin{cases} f_0(p) = f \left( \tilde{A}(p + \lceil \log \frac{6b}{\varepsilon} \rceil) + 1 \right), \\ f_{m+1}(p) = \max\{f_0(p), \theta_b(\varepsilon_0, f_m, p)\} \quad \text{for } m < M. \end{cases}$$

## Corollary

Let now  $\rho$  be a common Cauchy rate for the  $T$ -Halpern iterations  $(w_n(u))$ , for all  $u \in C$ . Then

$$\Psi(\varepsilon, f) = \Psi[b, \delta, A, \rho](\varepsilon, f) = \sigma(\varepsilon, \max\{\rho(\varepsilon_0), A(1) + 1\})$$

is a Cauchy rate for  $(x_n)$ , where  $\sigma(\varepsilon, \rho) := \tilde{A}(\rho + \lceil \log \frac{6b}{\varepsilon} \rceil) + 1$  with  $\tilde{A}$ ,  $b$ , and  $\varepsilon_0$  are as before,

## Corollary

Let now  $\rho$  be a common Cauchy rate for the  $T$ -Halpern iterations  $(w_n(u))$ , for all  $u \in C$ . Then

$$\Psi(\varepsilon, f) = \Psi[b, \delta, A, \rho](\varepsilon, f) = \sigma(\varepsilon, \max\{\rho(\varepsilon_0), A(1) + 1\})$$

is a Cauchy rate for  $(x_n)$ , where  $\sigma(\varepsilon, \rho) := \tilde{A}(\rho + \lceil \log \frac{6b}{\varepsilon} \rceil) + 1$  with  $\tilde{A}$ ,  $b$ , and  $\varepsilon_0$  are as before,

The quantitative result “Cauchy rate  $\rightarrow$  Cauchy rate” shows that Suzuki’s arguments are essentially constructive, which was not obvious.

## Corollary

Let now  $\rho$  be a common Cauchy rate for the  $T$ -Halpern iterations  $(w_n(u))$ , for all  $u \in C$ . Then

$$\Psi(\varepsilon, f) = \Psi[b, \delta, A, \rho](\varepsilon, f) = \sigma(\varepsilon, \max\{\rho(\varepsilon_0), A(1) + 1\})$$

is a Cauchy rate for  $(x_n)$ , where  $\sigma(\varepsilon, \rho) := \tilde{A}(\rho + \lceil \log \frac{6b}{\varepsilon} \rceil) + 1$  with  $\tilde{A}$ ,  $b$ , and  $\varepsilon_0$  are as before,

The quantitative result “Cauchy rate  $\rightarrow$  Cauchy rate” shows that Suzuki’s arguments are essentially constructive, which was not obvious.

We have shown that this analysis largely holds in a more general geodesic setting (*‘generalization of proofs’*)

## Some Applications

- [Kohlenbach, Sipoş (2020)], using the results from [Kohlenbach, Leuştean (2012)], obtained a rate of metastability for the Halpern iteration in Banach spaces which are both uniformly smooth and uniformly convex.
- [Kohlenbach, Leuştean (2012)] extracted a rate of metastability in  $CAT(0)$ .

Hence, one obtains rates of metastability for the viscosity version.

In Hilbert spaces, Bauschke generalized Halpern's iteration in a different way.

Let  $T_1, \dots, T_N$  be nonexpansive maps on  $C$ . Bauschke proved the convergence of  $(S_n)$ -H, for  $S_n = T_{[n+1]}$ , where  $[n] = n \bmod N$ .

- In [Ferreira, Leuştean, P. (2019)], an analysis of Bauschke's proof allowed for the extraction of a rate of metastability for Bauschke's iteration  $(S_n)$ -H.

Hence, one obtains a rate of metastability for the viscosity version.

Körnlein gave a quantitative analysis of viscosity-Bauschke. Although, the rates are obtained through different methods, they are of similar complexity.



The Halpern-type Proximal Point Algorithm, a strongly convergent version of the well-known proximal point algorithm, is defined by

$$\text{HPPA: } x_{n+1} = \alpha_n u + (1 - \alpha_n) J_{\gamma_n}(x_n), \quad n \in \mathbb{N}$$

where  $J_{\gamma_n}$  are resolvent functions of a monotone operator.

- In [P. (2021)], the convergence of HPPA under conditions that allow for the natural choice of parameters was studied, and rates of metastability were obtained.

Hence, one obtains a rate of metastability for the viscosity-HPPA

$$\text{vHPPA: } x_{n+1} = \alpha_n \phi(x_n) + (1 - \alpha_n) J_{\gamma_n}(x_n), \quad n \in \mathbb{N}$$

In [Kohlenbach (2020)], metastability for HPPA in Banach spaces which are both uniformly smooth and uniformly convex under very general conditions.

## Modulus of uniqueness

Suppose that  $T : C \rightarrow C$  has at most one fixed point, i.e.

$$(1) \forall p_1, p_2 \in C (p_1 = Tp_1 \wedge p_2 = Tp_2 \rightarrow p_1 = p_2).$$

We say that  $T$  has uniformly at most one fixed point with **modulus of uniqueness**  $\omega : (0, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$  if

$$(2) \forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall p_1, p_2 \in C \\ (\|p_1 - Tp_1\|, \|p_2 - Tp_2\| \leq \omega(\varepsilon) \rightarrow \|p_1 - p_2\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

## Modulus of uniqueness

Suppose that  $T : C \rightarrow C$  has at most one fixed point, i.e.

$$(1) \forall p_1, p_2 \in C (p_1 = Tp_1 \wedge p_2 = Tp_2 \rightarrow p_1 = p_2).$$

We say that  $T$  has uniformly at most one fixed point with **modulus of uniqueness**  $\omega : (0, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$  if

$$(2) \forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall p_1, p_2 \in C \\ (\|p_1 - Tp_1\|, \|p_2 - Tp_2\| \leq \omega(\varepsilon) \rightarrow \|p_1 - p_2\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

If  $T$  is continuous and  $C$  is compact, (1) implies the existence of a modulus  $\omega$  such that (2), but in general (2) is stronger than (1).

## From uniqueness to Cauchy rates

- $(x_n)$  is *asymptotically regular* (with respect to a map  $T$ ) if
$$\lim \|x_n - T(x_n)\| = 0.$$
- In many cases, it is possible to obtain a **rate of asymptotic regularity**, i.e. a function  $\mu : (0, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$  satisfying

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall n \geq \mu(\varepsilon) (\|x_n - T(x_n)\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

## From uniqueness to Cauchy rates

- $(x_n)$  is *asymptotically regular* (with respect to a map  $T$ ) if
 
$$\lim \|x_n - T(x_n)\| = 0.$$
- In many cases, it is possible to obtain a **rate of asymptotic regularity**, i.e. a function  $\mu : (0, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$  satisfying

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall n \geq \mu(\varepsilon) \quad (\|x_n - T(x_n)\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

- If  $\omega$  is a modulus of uniqueness and  $\mu$  is a rate of asymptotic regularity, then we have a Cauchy rate:

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \forall i, j \geq \mu(\omega(\varepsilon)) \quad (\|x_i - x_j\| \leq \varepsilon).$$

Let  $X$  be a uniformly convex normed space.

Let  $T$  be a nonexpansive map on  $C$  such that  $A := \text{Id} - T$  is uniformly accretive operator in the sense of [Gwinner (1978)]:

there is a strictly increasing function  $\varphi : [0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  such that  $\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \varphi(t) = \infty$  and

$$\forall x, y \in C \exists j \in J(x - y) \\ (\langle A(x) - A(y), j \rangle \geq (\varphi(\|x\|) - \varphi(\|y\|)) \cdot (\|x\| - \|y\|)),$$

where  $J$  is the normalized duality map of  $X$ , i.e.

$$J(x) := \{j \in X^* : \langle x, j \rangle = \|j\|^2 = \|x\|^2\}.$$

Let  $X$  be a uniformly convex normed space.

Let  $T$  be a nonexpansive map on  $C$  such that  $A := \text{Id} - T$  is uniformly accretive operator in the sense of [Gwinner (1978)]:

there is a strictly increasing function  $\varphi : [0, \infty) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  such that  $\lim_{t \rightarrow \infty} \varphi(t) = \infty$  and

$$\forall x, y \in C \exists j \in J(x - y) \\ (\langle A(x) - A(y), j \rangle \geq (\varphi(\|x\|) - \varphi(\|y\|)) \cdot (\|x\| - \|y\|)),$$

where  $J$  is the normalized duality map of  $X$ , i.e.

$$J(x) := \{j \in X^* : \langle x, j \rangle = \|j\|^2 = \|x\|^2\}.$$

There is a function  $\Omega : (0, \infty)^2 \rightarrow (0, \infty)$  satisfying

$$\forall x, y \in C \forall K, \varepsilon > 0 \exists j \in J(x - y) \\ (\|x\|, \|y\| \leq K \wedge \left| \|x\| - \|y\| \right| \geq \varepsilon \rightarrow \langle A(x) - A(y), j \rangle \geq \Omega(\varepsilon, K)),$$

## Proposition

Let  $b \in \mathbb{N}^*$  be such that  $\forall x \in C$  ( $\|x\| \leq b$ ), and write  $\Omega(\varepsilon, b) = \Omega(\varepsilon)$ . Let  $\eta$  be a modulus of uniform convexity.

The function

$$\omega_b(\varepsilon) := \frac{1}{16b} \Omega \left( \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \cdot \eta \left( \frac{\varepsilon}{b} \right) \right) \cdot \eta \left( \frac{1}{8b^2} \Omega \left( \frac{\varepsilon}{2} \cdot \eta \left( \frac{\varepsilon}{b} \right) \right) \right)$$

is a modulus of uniqueness for being a fixed point of  $T$ .



## Proposition

Let  $b \in \mathbb{N}^*$  be such that  $\forall x \in C$  ( $\|x\| \leq b$ ), and write  $\Omega(\varepsilon, b) = \Omega(\varepsilon)$ . Let  $\eta$  be a modulus of uniform convexity. The function

$$\omega_b(\varepsilon) := \frac{1}{16b} \Omega\left(\frac{\varepsilon}{2} \cdot \eta\left(\frac{\varepsilon}{b}\right)\right) \cdot \eta\left(\frac{1}{8b^2} \Omega\left(\frac{\varepsilon}{2} \cdot \eta\left(\frac{\varepsilon}{b}\right)\right)\right)$$

is a modulus of uniqueness for being a fixed point of  $T$ .

Using a rate from [Kohlenbach, Leuştean (2012)],

## Theorem (Cauchy rate for Halpern)

For  $x_0, u \in C$ , consider  $x_{n+1} = \frac{1}{n+1}u + (1 - \frac{1}{n+1})T(x_n)$ . Then  $(x_n)$  is a Cauchy sequence with Cauchy rate  $\mu(\omega_b(\varepsilon))$ , where

$$\mu(\varepsilon) := \left\lceil \frac{4b}{\varepsilon} + \frac{32b^2}{\varepsilon^2} \right\rceil.$$

## Final remarks

- For  $X$  complete and  $C$  closed, we have rate of convergence.

## Final remarks

- For  $X$  complete and  $C$  closed, we have rate of convergence.
- The ‘viscosity’ results were proven in the general setting of  $W$ -hyperbolic spaces, for the more general Rakotch maps instead of strict contractions, and also for Browder-type sequences.
- This allows for additional applications using previous proof mining studies (e.g. in  $CAT(0)$  spaces for Browder-type iterations).






## Final remarks




- For  $X$  complete and  $C$  closed, we have rate of convergence.
- The ‘viscosity’ results were proven in the general setting of  $W$ -hyperbolic spaces, for the more general Rakotch maps instead of strict contractions, and also for Browder-type sequences.
- This allows for additional applications using previous proof mining studies (e.g. in  $CAT(0)$  spaces for Browder-type iterations).
- We also considered algorithms with error terms.

## Final remarks

- For  $X$  complete and  $C$  closed, we have rate of convergence.
- The ‘viscosity’ results were proven in the general setting of  $W$ -hyperbolic spaces, for the more general Rakotch maps instead of strict contractions, and also for Browder-type sequences.
- This allows for additional applications using previous proof mining studies (e.g. in  $CAT(0)$  spaces for Browder-type iterations).
- We also considered algorithms with error terms.
- Our proofs correspond to quantitative versions of the original arguments, and actually establish the convergence to the desirable limit point.

# References

-  T. Suzuki. *Moudafi's viscosity approximations with Meir-Keeler contractions*, ***Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications***, 325(1):342–352, 2007.
-  U. Kohlenbach and A. Sipoş. *The finitary content of sunny nonexpansive retractions*, To appear in: ***Communications in Contemporary Mathematics***, arXiv:1812.04940, 2020.
-  U. Kohlenbach and L. Leuştean. *On the computational content of convergence proofs via Banach limits*, ***Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences***, 370.1971: 3449-3463, 2012.
-  U. Kohlenbach and L. Leuştean. *Effective metastability of Halpern iterates in  $CAT(0)$  spaces*, ***Advances in Mathematics***, 231.5: 2526-2556, 2012.
-  F. Ferreira, L. Leuştean and P. Pinto, *On the removal of weak compactness arguments in proof mining*, ***Advances in Mathematics***, vol. 354, 2019.

-  P. Pinto, *A rate of metastability for the Halpern type Proximal Point Algorithm*, **Numerical Functional Analysis and Optimization**, 42(3): 320-343, 2021.
-  U. Kohlenbach, *Quantitative analysis of a Halpern-type Proximal Point Algorithm for accretive operators in Banach spaces*, **Journal of Nonlinear and Convex Analysis**, 21(9):2125–2138, 2020.
-  J. Gwinner, *On the convergence of some iteration processes in uniformly convex Banach spaces*, **Proceedings of the American Mathematical Society**, 71(1), 29-35, 1978.

Thank you